EX. 17

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS AUSTIN DIVISION

JARI MCPHERSON, *
JERALD SAMS, and *
DANIEL MARTINEZ, *
Plaintiffs *

* CIVIL ACTION

v. * NO. 1:20-cv-01223-DAE

*

TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF *
PUBLIC SAFETY, *
Defendant. *

VIDEOCONFERENCED ORAL DEPOSITION

OF

RAMIRO SALDIVAR

Wednesday, February 1, 2023

(REMOTELY REPORTED)

VIDEOCONFERENCED ORAL DEPOSITION OF RAMIRO SALDIVAR, produced as a witness at the instance of the Plaintiffs, and duly sworn, was taken in the abovestyled and numbered cause on Wednesday, February 1, 2023, from 9:13 a.m. to 2:02 p.m., before Debbie D. Cunningham, CSR, in and for the State of Texas, remotely reported via Machine Shorthand, pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

--00000--

42 44 1 you? 1 A. Yes. 2 A. That there's no tolerance for that in 2 Q. Okay. And neither did Chris Hanson 3 report that incident of sexual harassment by 3 the workplace. Q. Which means what happens when it 4 you of Marisela Reynaga up the chain of 5 occurs? What are the consequences when it command, correct? occurs if there's a zero tolerance? MR. HARRIS: Object to the form 7 A. There's an investigation. Then after 7 of the question. the investigation, there are some type of 8 A. Not to my knowledge, no. 9 punitive outcomes; and then based on those Q. So not to your knowledge. 10 outcomes, there's a determination. It varies. If Chris Hanson had reported it 11 up the chain of command, the chain of command 11 I'm not sure -- I can't really say what that 12 outcome would be until the investigation is 12 was obligated to institute an investigation, 13 concluded. 13 correct? 14 Q. Yeah, but --14 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form 15 A. It could --15 of the question. 16 Q. Yeah, go ahead. 16 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) Correct? 17 A. It could be up to termination, but it 17 A. Yes, sir. 18 18 Q. Okay. According to Texas Department varies. 19 Q. Okay. And that policy and other 19 of Public Safety's policies. 20 policies adopted by and enforced at that time 20 And you know that that never 21 that you had this incident occurred with --21 occurred, correct? between yourself and Marisela Reynaga called 22 22 A. Yes, sir. 23 for you to report that, correct? 23 Q. Okay. And so that means that if 24 A. Yes, sir. 24 Lieutenant Hanson, as an agent of notice, as 25 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form 25 were you, did report that up the chain of 43 45 1 of the question. 1 command, the chain of command did not follow 2 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) Okay. And it also 2 agency policy, specifically 18.25 of the called for Lieutenant Hanson to report that 3 general manual, citing and calling for zero incident, correct? 4 tolerance for sexual harassment, correct? 4 5 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form A. Yes, sir. 6 of the question. Q. Okay. Did Captain Koenig have 7 A. Yes. knowledge of this incident, Marisela Reynaga's 8 Q. (BY MR. HARRIS) Okay. And your complaint of your sexual harassment against testimony here today is that neither one of you 9 reported that up the chain of command, correct? 10 10 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form 11 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form 11 of the question, calls for speculation. 12 of the question. 12 A. I do not know. 13 A. I didn't report it because she told 13 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) Captain Koenig and 14 Chris Hanson were very close, were they not? 14 me that she was not going to make a big deal out of it and that she was not going to file 15 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form 15 anything against me. She just wanted to bring 16 of the question, calls for speculation. it to my attention. 17 17 A. I believe so. 18 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) My only question is, Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) Okay. In fact, to sir: You did not report it, correct, up the 19 your knowledge, they were really close friends, 19 20 chain, correct? 20 correct? 21 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form 21 A. Yes, sir. 22 of the question. 22 Q. Do you recall the incident in which 23 A. Yes. 23 Belinda Pedroza filed and/or voiced, one or the 24 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) Yes, you did not 24 other and maybe even both, a discrimination 25 report it, correct? complaint against Rebecca Butler, who was her

1 supervisor at that time?

2 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form

3 of the question.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) And did you report

6 that up the chain?

7 A. Yes, I did.

Q. Who did you report that to?

9 A. Mark Koenig.

10 Q. You reported it to Mark Koenig.

11 And what became of that

12 complaint?

8

13 A. I'm not sure, sir. I just know that

I reported it up, and I'm not sure if it was 14

15 investigated or not. I'm not aware of any.

16 Q. Actually, you did not report that to

Koenig, did you? You actually reported it to 17

Rebecca Butler; isn't that true? 18

19 A. No, I reported it to Mark Koenig; and

20 then Mark Koenig asked me why I was reporting

21 it to him when it should be reported to, I

guess, her division, which is a different 22

23 division.

24 Q. So Mark Koenig, as far as you know,

25 did not take any action reporting that up the 1 A. Yes, sir.

2 Q. Okay. But you didn't do that, did

3 you?

10

46

4 A. Because I notified my chain of

5 command. That's why. And I believe -- if I

remember, I believe that Mark Koenig did report

it to Nathanael Haddox because I was CC'd on

that e-mail. Nathanael Haddox is our EEO

9 representative.

Q. And you don't have a copy of that

11 e-mail with you today, do you, sir?

12 A. No. sir.

13 Q. Okay. So you said a moment ago that

you didn't know whether or not Captain Koenig 14

reported that complaint of discrimination by

16 Belinda Pedroza against Rebecca Butler up the

chain; but now, you're saying he did. Am I --

18 A. I remembered. Yes, sir, I

19 remembered that there was an e-mail that was

20 generated to Nathanael Haddox, not up the chain

but to Nathanael Haddox, by Mark Koenig about

22 the incident.

47

23 Q. Okay. And that was after you had

24 given Rebecca Butler a heads-up, correct?

25 A. Correct.

1 chain, correct?

2 A. I don't know. That's correct.

Q. That's what I'm asking you. As far 3

as you know, Mark Koenig didn't take any action

to report that up the chain, correct?

6 A. I don't know. That's the thing, I

don't know. I don't know if he did or did not.

Q. Yeah, that's my question to you is

that don't know, correct?

10 MR. HARRIS: Objection, asked

11 and answered.

12

Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) Sir?

13 A. Correct.

Q. Okay. All right. And you don't know 14

what -- and you also reported it to Rebecca 15

16 Butler, correct?

A. Correct. 17

Q. And you call yourself, in doing so, 18

giving Rebecca Butler a heads-up, correct? 19

20 A. Correct.

Q. So why didn't you report that -- if 21

22 Koenig told you you didn't report it to the

right person, he left it up to you now to take

24 it up the chain now in, what, another division,

was it? Did you say that, another division?

Q. Okay. Why didn't you go -- instead

2 of giving Rebecca Butler a heads-up, why did

you not go to someone above her or someone

outside of her chain of command?

A. Well, I didn't give her a heads-up.

It was more like, "Watch what you say in front

of Belinda." I guess that's what you can say a

heads-up; but I didn't report it above her

chain of command because I reported it to my

10 immediate chain of command, which is Mark

11 Koenig.

12 Q. And he gave you direction to go to

13 her chain of command, didn't he?

14 A. He didn't have a direction. He

didn't tell me to do that. He just said. "Next 15

time do that." And he's the one that e-mailed

Nathanael Haddox. 17

Q. Okay. All right. So why did you

tell Rebecca Butler to be careful what she says 19

around Belinda Pedroza? How was that going to

21 help anything?

22 A. I wasn't trying to help anything. I

23 was just telling her, "Watch what you say as a

24

25 So then let me make sure Lunderstand 49

152 150 1 report it to my captain; and then it goes up. That's what I was apologizing for, getting off

6

8

13

15

- 2 So the captain was part of that text group. He
- 3 had been notified.
- 4 Q. But the captain clearly -- even if
- 5 what you're saying was true -- the captain was
- a part of all those texts, the trail of text
- 7 messages, correct?
- A. Yes, sir. 8
- 9 Q. But you still didn't report Hanson.
- 10 Why treat Hanson more favorably than McPherson?
- 11 The question is still there.
- 12 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form
- 13 of the question.
- A. Again, I reported McPherson to my 14
- captain because it's something that I heard so 15
- that they can take a look into it. If I was to 16
- report Hanson to my captain, they would have
- 18 taken a look into it. If the captain was aware
- of those pictures, why would I need to report 19
- them to the captain if he's part of the 20
- 21 conversations?
- Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) Did you ever talk 22
- 23 negatively about Mr. McPherson --
- 24 A. No, sir.
- 25 Q. -- to other department employees?

- on the wrong foot.
- 3 MR. HARRIS: Hold on. Another
- 4 witness has
- 5 MR. MUNGO: Go ahead. Go ahead.
 - MR. HARRIS: It is 1:30, and so
- 7 we need to pause.
 - MR. MUNGO: I'm not done.
- MR. HARRIS: I need to deal with 9
- 10 the next witness.
- 11 MR. MUNGO: Well, we can talk
- 12 about that, since I'm not done, off the record.
 - THE REPORTER: We're going off
- 14 the record at 1:28 p.m.
 - (Off the record from 1:28 to 1:29 p.m.)
- 16 THE REPORTER: We're back on the
- 17 record at 1:29 p.m.
- 18 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) So you apologized to
- McPherson for treating him badly without you 19
- 20 ever getting to know him; isn't that correct?
- 21 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form
- 22 of the question.
- 23 A. No, that's not what I said. I said
- that I apologized for starting off on the wrong
- foot with him.

151 153

- A. No, sir. I actually like Jari a lot. 1
- 2 Q. But Mr. McPherson filed a complaint
- on you based on that conduct, correct? 3
- A. Yes. sir. 4
- 5 Q. But you're saying that conduct never
- occurred, saying that Mr. McPherson was wrong
- in his allegations against you, that it never
- occurred? 8
- A. Well, the allegation was made. There
- 10 was an investigation that was done, and the
- investigation concluded that no further action 11
- needs to be taken. I was never part of that 12
- investigation. I was never involved. By the 13
- 14 time they concluded that investigation, they
- had already deemed that allegation as not 15
- needing to be looked at. 16
- 17 Q. Did you ever apologize to
- Mr. McPherson for listening to everyone else 18
- when Mr. McPherson first got to Region 7? 19
- 20 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form
- 21 of the question.
- 22 A. I never apologized for stuff that was
- said. I just apologized in the form that, hey, 23
- whatever I knew about him was untrue; and,
- therefore, we got off on the wrong foot.

- Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) What do you mean,
 - starting off on the wrong foot? Explain that
 - for the record.
 - 4 A. Well, when he got here, you know, he
 - 5 came here with issues that, I guess, happened
 - to him in Temple or Killeen, the Region 6 area.
 - And so, when he got here, I was told he should
 - have been reporting to me on the 1st; and he
 - didn't. I guess that there was some
 - 10 miscommunication or whatever, and that created
- 11 some friction right off the bat. And so that's
- why, you know, we started off on the wrong
- 13 foot: and that's how it went.
- 14 I don't have any animosity
- 15 towards Jari, even after the complaint happened
- and I was made aware of what was on that
- complaint and whatnot. And I just told him,
- "Hey, man, I'm sorry you felt that way." And
- we went from there. I didn't take anything 19
- 21 Q. Who told you what happened with
- McPherson in Killeen?
- A. He did. 23
- 24 Q. He told you about that. You didn't
- hear anything about that before he told you,

166

1 speculative; but, yes, it's a fair assumption 1 Q

- 2 to say that.
- 3 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) And, really, Mark
- 4 Koenig treated you like crap, in a way of
- 5 expression. Would you agree with that? Is
- 6 that a fair statement?
- 7 A. I agree, yes, sir.
- 8 Q. And you don't believe that your race
- 9 had anything to do with that?
- 10 A. I would hope not, no, sir.
- 11 Q. But you don't know?
- 12 A. I do not know, yes, sir.
- 13 Q. It would be a fair statement to say
- 14 that it may possibly be one of the reasons,
- 15 correct?
- 16 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form
- 17 of the question.
- 18 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) It would be a fair
- 19 statement?
- 20 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form
- 21 of the question.
- 22 A. Again, I don't know.
- 23 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) No, you don't know;
- 24 but is it a fair statement to say possibly it
- 25 could be one of the reasons?

- 1 Q. Okay. So I'm not saying -- asking
 - 2 you do you know. I'm asking: Would it be a
 - 3 fair statement to say that your race and Danny
 - 4 Martinez's race would be among the possible
 - 5 reasons why you and Danny Martinez were treated
 - 6 so badly by Mark Koenig? That's all I'm
 - 7 asking. Is it a fair statement?
 - 8 MR. HARRIS: Objection. He's
 - 9 already answered the question he doesn't know.
 - 10 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) Do you understand I'm
 - 11 not asking you if you know that? I'm asking
 - 12 you: Would that be a fair statement that race
 - 3 could be one of the reasons why you and Danny
 - 14 Martinez was treated so badly, unfairly, by
 - 15 Mark Koenig?
 - 16 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form
 - 17 of the question.
 - 18 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) Would that be a fair
 - 19 statement?
 - 20 A. I believe that -- yes, we are both
 - 21 Hispanics; but I don't believe it was based on
 - 22 our race.

167

- 23 Q. But the point is that you don't know
- 24 that it was based on your race, correct?
- 25 A. That is correct.

A. I don't know. I would hope not, but

2 I don't know.

1

- 3 Q. Didn't you go to Mr. Martinez and
- 4 literally cried and vented with him about how
- 5 you were being treated by Koenig?
- 6 A. I don't think I cried, but I did have
- 7 a lot of conversations with Danny Martinez
- 8 about how I was treated by Mark Koenig. I9 don't think I've ever cried. I have cried when
- 10 speaking to Mark Koenig, but not to Danny
- 11 Martinez.
- 12 Q. And you don't feel that Koenig
- 13 harbors any racial animus towards people of
- 14 color?
- 15 A. Again, I don't know. I'm hoping not,
- 16 but I don't know.
- 17 Q. Okay. So it is among the possible
- 18 reasons why you were mistreated and why he
- 19 mistreated Danny Martinez. Would that be a
- 20 fair statement?
- 21 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form
- 22 of the question.
- 23 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) Would that be a fair
- 24 statement?
- 25 A. Again, I don't know; but I hope not.

1 MR. HARRIS: Asked and answered.

- Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) And the fact you
- 3 don't know means it's possible that race was
- 4 one of the reasons, right; is that fair to say?
- 5 MR. HARRIS: Asked and answered.
- 6 You're trying to get a sound bite out of him.
- 7 He's already given you his answer that he
- 8 doesn't know.
- 9 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) All right, sir. You
- 10 understand my question. You've said that you
- 11 don't know a number of times. All I'm asking
- 12 is: That means it's possible that race could
- 13 be one of the reasons. That's fair, right?
- 14 A. My answer is: I don't believe it has
- 15 anything to do with race.
- 16 Q. Well, but you don't know is the
- 17 point, correct?

20

- 18 MR. HARRIS: At this point
- 19 you're just arguing with him.
 - Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) Is that correct?
- 21 MR. HARRIS: He's already
- 22 answered the question.
- 23 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) Sir, is it fair to
- 24 say you don't know?
- 25 A. I don't know.

169

168

170 172 Q. Okay. Do you believe that 1 Goodwin is a part of a group that have 2 Captain Koenig showed favoritism to a 2 benefitted in terms of his career because he is lieutenant who is now a captain, Chris Hanson? 4 A. Yes, sir. 4 A. Again, I don't know any career path 5 Q. Did Captain Koenig give you favorable 5 or background on Goodwin to make a 6 evaluations? determination either way. 7 A. No. sir. 7 Q. Do you feel that the Texas Department of Public Safety handles all investigations, 8 Q. If not, why do you feel that you were including C-1s against White employees, the 9 given less-than-favorable evaluations? 10 A. For actions that I've taken. same as they do minority employees? 11 11 Q. Do you believe that the department, MR. HARRIS: Object to the form 12 Texas Department of Public Safety, has a 12 of the question. 13 good-old-boy system as pertains to the hiring 13 A. I believe that all investigations of 14 process and promotions? 14 allegations are taken seriously and the 15 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form investigators do a good job diligently to 16 investigate all allegations whether --16 of that question. 17 A. No, sir, I don't believe that. regardless of race or gender. 18 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) Do you believe the Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) Do you feel that good-old-boy system supports African Americans? minorities are afforded equal opportunity to 19 20 promote as their White counterparts? A. I believe the promotional system is a 21 21 system that has flaws, but it's a promotional A. Yes, sir, I believe so. 22 system that the department has that we have to 22 Q. Do you believe that minorities in DPS 23 abide by and play with. receive C-1s for fraudulent or minor violations 24 Q. Did Hanson ever complain of 24 and that White counterparts don't? 25 mistreatment from Koenig? 25 A. Can you repeat that? 171 173 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form Q. Yes. Do you believe that minorities 2 of the question. 2 in the Texas Department of Public Safety 3 receive C-1s for fraudulent or minor violations 3 A. Not to me, no, sir. 4 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) And they are both 4 that their White counterparts do not? 5 White males, correct? A. I do not know. 6 A. Yes, sir. 6 Q. Do you believe that C-1s block 7 Q. Would you say that Mark Koenig and 7 minorities from future promotions? Chris Hanson benefitted tremendously throughout A. I believe the current promotional their career paths from being part of that system where you have to disclose a C-1 does group of good old boys? block you from promotional opportunities, yes, 10 10 11 MR. HARRIS: Object to the form 11 sir. 12 12 Q. I talked to you about complaints of the question. 13 A. Without knowing their career paths 13 being filed against you by Belinda Pedroza and Marisela Reynaga. Were any other such 14 and their backgrounds, I can't answer that. 15 Q. (BY MR. MUNGO) Do you think that 15 complaints filed against you? they benefitted tremendously throughout their 16 A. No, sir. careers because they were White in terms of 17 17 Q. Okay. Do you recall promotions and other kinds of favorable 18 Lieutenant Martinez being mocked and over-18 19 treatment? 19 looked -- or mocked and being called a new 20 A. I don't believe so. 20 idea fairy? 21 Q. Why haven't you competed for 21 A. I don't recall that, no, sir. 22 promotional opportunities to captain? 22 Q. You've never said that about 23 A. I don't believe in competing for a 23 Lieutenant Martinez? 24 position I'm not ready for. 24 A. No. 25 Q. Would you say that Chief Floyd 25 MR. MUNGO: Okay. Give me just

		174			176
1	one moment, please.		1	I, RAMIRO SALDIVAR, have read the	
2	(Brief pause.)			foregoing deposition and hereby affix my signature that	
3	MR. MUNGO: Okay. Drew, pass		3	same is true and correct, except as noted herein.	
4	the witness. Thank you very much,		4	came to true and concest, encopt ac notice notice.	
5	Mr. Saldivar.		5		
6	THE WITNESS: Thank you.		6	RAMIRO SALDIVAR	
7	THE REPORTER: Mr. Harris, do		7	KAMIKO GALDIVAK	
8	you have any questions of the witness?			THE STATE OF)	
9	MR. HARRIS: No, we'll reserve;		9	Before me, , on	
10	but the witness would like the opportunity to			this day personally appeared RAMIRO SALDIVAR, known to	
				me (or proved to me under oath or through	
11 12	review and sign the deposition.		11 12	•	
	THE REPORTER: And do you need a) (description of identity card or other	
13	, ,			document) to be the person whose name is subscribed to	
14	MR. HARRIS: Yes.			the foregoing instrument and acknowledged to me that	
15	MR. MUNGO: Yes.			they executed same for the purposes and consideration	
16	THE REPORTER: This concludes			therein expressed.	
17	·		17	Given under my hand and seal of office on	
18	(Deposition adjourned at			this, day of	
19	• •		19		
20	ooOoo		20		
21			21		
22			22	NOTARY PUBLIC IN AND FOR	
23			23	THE STATE OF	
24			24	My Commission Expires:	
25			25		
		175			177
	QUANGES AND SIGNATURE	175		OTATE OF TEXAS.	177
1	CHANGES AND SIGNATURE	175		STATE OF TEXAS)	177
2	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION:	175	2	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION	177
2		175	2	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that	177
2	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023	175	2 3 4	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION	177
2 3 4	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a	177
2 3 4 5	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action.	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. I further certify that pursuant to FRCP	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. I further certify that pursuant to FRCP Rule 30(f)(1) that the signature of the deponent was	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. I further certify that pursuant to FRCP Rule 30(f)(1) that the signature of the deponent was requested by the deponent or a party before the completion of the deposition and that the signature is to be before any notary public and returned within 30	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. I further certify that pursuant to FRCP Rule 30(f)(1) that the signature of the deponent was requested by the deponent or a party before the completion of the deposition and that the signature is to be before any notary public and returned within 30 days from date receipt of the transcript. If returned,	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. I further certify that pursuant to FRCP Rule 30(f)(1) that the signature of the deponent was requested by the deponent or a party before the completion of the deposition and that the signature is to be before any notary public and returned within 30 days from date receipt of the transcript. If returned, the attached Changes and Signature Page contains any	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. I further certify that pursuant to FRCP Rule 30(f)(1) that the signature of the deponent was requested by the deponent or a party before the completion of the deposition and that the signature is to be before any notary public and returned within 30 days from date receipt of the transcript. If returned, the attached Changes and Signature Page contains any changes and the reasons therefore.	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. I further certify that pursuant to FRCP Rule 30(f)(1) that the signature of the deponent was requested by the deponent or a party before the completion of the deposition and that the signature is to be before any notary public and returned within 30 days from date receipt of the transcript. If returned, the attached Changes and Signature Page contains any changes and the reasons therefore. Subscribed and sworn to by me this day,	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. I further certify that pursuant to FRCP Rule 30(f)(1) that the signature of the deponent was requested by the deponent or a party before the completion of the deposition and that the signature is to be before any notary public and returned within 30 days from date receipt of the transcript. If returned, the attached Changes and Signature Page contains any changes and the reasons therefore.	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. I further certify that pursuant to FRCP Rule 30(f)(1) that the signature of the deponent was requested by the deponent or a party before the completion of the deposition and that the signature is to be before any notary public and returned within 30 days from date receipt of the transcript. If returned, the attached Changes and Signature Page contains any changes and the reasons therefore. Subscribed and sworn to by me this day,	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. I further certify that pursuant to FRCP Rule 30(f)(1) that the signature of the deponent was requested by the deponent or a party before the completion of the deposition and that the signature is to be before any notary public and returned within 30 days from date receipt of the transcript. If returned, the attached Changes and Signature Page contains any changes and the reasons therefore. Subscribed and sworn to by me this day, February 16, 2023.	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. I further certify that pursuant to FRCP Rule 30(f)(1) that the signature of the deponent was requested by the deponent or a party before the completion of the deposition and that the signature is to be before any notary public and returned within 30 days from date receipt of the transcript. If returned, the attached Changes and Signature Page contains any changes and the reasons therefore. Subscribed and sworn to by me this day, February 16, 2023. Debbie D. Cunningham, CSR Expiration: 6/30/23 INTEGRITY LEGAL SUPPORT SOLUTIONS	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. I further certify that pursuant to FRCP Rule 30(f)(1) that the signature of the deponent was requested by the deponent or a party before the completion of the deposition and that the signature is to be before any notary public and returned within 30 days from date receipt of the transcript. If returned, the attached Changes and Signature Page contains any changes and the reasons therefore. Subscribed and sworn to by me this day, February 16, 2023. Debbie D. Cunningham, CSR Expiration: 6/30/23 INTEGRITY LEGAL SUPPORT SOLUTIONS 9901 Brodie Ln, Ste. 160-400	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. I further certify that pursuant to FRCP Rule 30(f)(1) that the signature of the deponent was requested by the deponent or a party before the completion of the deposition and that the signature is to be before any notary public and returned within 30 days from date receipt of the transcript. If returned, the attached Changes and Signature Page contains any changes and the reasons therefore. Subscribed and sworn to by me this day, February 16, 2023. Debbie D. Cunningham, CSR Expiration: 6/30/23 INTEGRITY LEGAL SUPPORT SOLUTIONS 9901 Brodie Ln, Ste. 160-400 Austin, Texas 78748	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. I further certify that pursuant to FRCP Rule 30(f)(1) that the signature of the deponent was requested by the deponent or a party before the completion of the deposition and that the signature is to be before any notary public and returned within 30 days from date receipt of the transcript. If returned, the attached Changes and Signature Page contains any changes and the reasons therefore. Subscribed and sworn to by me this day, February 16, 2023. Debbie D. Cunningham, CSR Expiration: 6/30/23 INTEGRITY LEGAL SUPPORT SOLUTIONS 9901 Brodie Ln, Ste. 160-400 Austin, Texas 78748 www.integritylegal.support	177
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	WITNESS NAME: DATE OF DEPOSITION: RAMIRO SALDIVAR February 1, 2023 PAGE/LINE CHANGE REASON	175	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION I, DEBBIE D. CUNNINGHAM, CSR, hereby certify that the witness was duly sworn and that this transcript is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. I further certify that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties or attorneys in the action in which this proceeding was taken. Further, I am not a relative or employee of any attorney of record in this cause, nor am I financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. I further certify that pursuant to FRCP Rule 30(f)(1) that the signature of the deponent was requested by the deponent or a party before the completion of the deposition and that the signature is to be before any notary public and returned within 30 days from date receipt of the transcript. If returned, the attached Changes and Signature Page contains any changes and the reasons therefore. Subscribed and sworn to by me this day, February 16, 2023. Debbie D. Cunningham, CSR Expiration: 6/30/23 INTEGRITY LEGAL SUPPORT SOLUTIONS 9901 Brodie Ln, Ste. 160-400 Austin, Texas 78748	177